Introduction

In 2001, Hawai`i State Legislature enacted ARTS FIRST, identifying the arts as a core subject in the state. One of the major goals articulated in the ARTS FIRST Hawai`i Strategic Plan is to guarantee a comprehensive arts education for every elementary student by the year 2018, but today, we are unclear where we stand on this goal. Some elementary schools employ part-time resource teachers while others tap their community resources for arts experiences. Some engage professional artists in residencies for students in a single grade level, while others support selected teachers in arts professional development. In other schools, there is very little evidence of arts curriculum. The individual initiatives schools take to ensure some of their students have exposure to and engagement in the arts are important, but do not yet meet the mandate to reach all students of all elementary schools in Hawai'i. Nor do these catch-as-catch-can opportunities provide a comprehensive, enduring approach to arts education with continuity of instruction.

Pomaika'i Elementary School provides one solution to this conundrum with a school-wide arts integration model. The school opened its doors in 2007 with a commitment to arts at the onset, explicitly incorporating the arts to support the development of the whole child, promising to engage a variety of intelligences, learning styles, and backgrounds by providing students with opportunities to construct new understandings across the curriculum through the arts. In the spring of 2012, Pomaika'i Elementary School graduated its first class of students that had attended from grades K-5. The research question of this inquiry evolved from the growing curiosity of Pomaika'i teachers, administrators, parents, and community partners who had invested in providing these children with an education model significantly different from other schools in Hawai'i where reforms are now spurred by Race to the Top funding priorities. They

wanted to know: How does school-wide arts integration in an elementary setting impact student success as they transition to middle school?

Background

Advocates for arts in education date back as early as Benjamin Franklin (Purnell, 2004) and Horace Mann (Gullatt, 2008). Arts education has been a subject of concern for great American thinkers such as John Dewey (1934) Maxine Greene (1995) and Elliot Eisner (2002) who contend the arts are as central to education as they are to humanity. A growing body of evidence points to the social and emotional benefits of art education, including development of imagination, risk-taking, motivation, belonging, engagement, self-confidence, self-expression, and empathy (Caldwell & Vaughan, 2012; Eisner, 2002; Mason, Steedly, & Thormann, 2008; Stinson, 1997; Sullivan, 2003). Through analysis of longitudinal data, Catterall (2009) suggest students with low social economic status demonstrate stronger pro-social behaviors when provided an arts-rich education. Although studies such as these often demonstrate correlation rather than causality, similar research supports the hypothesis that students with arts-rich backgrounds have significantly experience more success in both academic and civic behaviors than their counterparts (J. S. Catterall, Dumais, & Hampden-Thompson, 2012).

Alternatively, in a meta-analysis of causal relationships between arts instruction and non-arts outcomes, Hetland and Winner (2001) identify few areas with reliable links. The authors argue policy makers should not justify the inclusion of arts curriculum based on claims of secondary benefits; one does not study history to improve in mathematics. They add this caveat: increased motivation, confidence, and effort inherent in arts integrated curriculum may provide powerful entry points to academic learning, especially with students who may not be academically inclined. This proposition deserves further attention (Hetland & Winner, 2001).

Arts integration has become an increasingly dynamic framework for arts curriculum, especially at the elementary level (Cornett, 1999; Krug & Cohen-Evon, 2000; McDonald & Fisher, 2000; Skilling & Carstensen, 2003). Some believe using the arts for instrumental outcomes (especially when justifying the presence of arts in the curriculum based upon educational objectives that are not unique to the art) demean, devalue and dilute the arts (Eisner, 1972). Stokes (2004) argues against this notion, contending that arts integrated experiences still advance powerful learning in the arts themselves. Others educators find arts integration a powerful pedagogy and commonly publish examples of best practices in which purposeful integration increases student interest and understanding in both the art forms and core content materials (Fisher & McDonald, 2004; Warner & Andersen, 2004).

There is no universal definition of what the arts are or what arts integration should look like. Remer (1990) envisions an upward spiraling evolution of integration, including teaching with, in, about and through the arts. In other words, teachers may incorporate a subtle arts orientation using the arts to create ambiance in the classroom (with), teach the arts by providing explicit instruction in a discreet art form (in), teach arts as historical or intellectual content (about), or apply arts techniques to reach understanding in other content (through). In Remer's taxonomy, all forms of arts instruction are viable and valuable to varying purposes and degrees. Importantly, each delivery system serves a powerful, purposeful function when working in conjunction with the others. For example, children learning *about* an art form have greater exposure and understanding when they are also active participants *in* the art form, and learning a range of content *through* the art from. Arts integration may thread throughout a curriculum with through variety of methods and for a range of purposes.

Similarly, Murray (2004) proposes a framework crowded with prepositions, discussing drama as something that can be done to, for, or with children. She develops her ideas into a continuum of status: peripheral, utilitarian, craft, and finally art. In the peripheral mode art is a part of the environment, utilitarian art serves a purpose as a coffee mug might, a craft requires technique and skill, and art is a pure act of creativity.

Bresler (1995) observes a variety of teaching styles and pinpoints the barriers each style poses to powerful arts integration. A subservient approach is used most commonly, in which craft-like arts activities spice up other subjects. For example, a teacher might use a song to introduce a new subject as an anticipatory set. Bresler (1995) rarely observes a co-equal, cognitive approach in which higher order cognitive skills combine with aesthetic qualities in meaningful learning. More often, she perceives an affective style utilized to change the pace or mood of a classroom as students become immersed in feelings and responses stimulated by experiences in the arts. Finally, Bresler's (1995) social integration style includes events such as schools stage performances or exhibitions in the spirit of community celebration. These varying descriptions help to characterize the ways we see arts integration happening in classrooms across the nation.

Pomaikaʻi Elementary School has adopted the definition of arts integration developed by the Kennedy Center: "Arts integration is an approach to teaching in which students construct and demonstrate understanding through an art form. Students engage in in a creative process which connects an art form and another subject and meets evolving objectives in both" ("What is arts integration: Explore the Kennedy Center's comprehensive definition," 2012). This definition emphasizes how arts are pathways for teaching and learning. Students must be involved in

creating art, not only responding to arts experiences, or preparing for performances. Finally, this definition requires learning goals in both an art from and a non-arts content area.

In this current era of accountability, arts integration may be devolving into a term used when the arts are tools to teach content on tests. Mishook & Kornhaber (2006) suggest schools serving a low socio economic status population tend to provide the arts in a subservient fashion, as low quality ornamentation to tested material. They contend a stronger coequal relationship between the arts and tested subjects is only maintained in schools with a strong arts focus, mission, and faculty who are well-prepared and committed to the endeavor (Mishook & Kornhaber, 2006). These conclusions are echoed by Rabkin & Redmond (2006) who detail characteristics of powerful arts integration school programs that: a) develop meaningful partnerships between schools, community arts organizations, and local teaching artists; b) value student achievement and school development as essential components of their missions; c) engage a range of educators from multiple disciplines to make powerful intersections between the arts and other subjects, and d) utilize the arts as methods of learning and communicating understanding, and engage both arts curriculum and arts integration in other subject areas.

Pomaikaʻi Elementary School meets each of these criteria and while other Hawaiʻi schools demonstrate a commitment to arts education, Pomaikaʻi is the only public school in Hawaiʻi with a whole school arts integrated curriculum. Partnership with the Maui Arts & Cultural Center (MACC) ensures the school's access to nationally renowned arts education consultants and presenters. The staff and board of directors at the MACC have sustained an ongoing commitment to raise community funds to support meaningful arts integration and ongoing self-study to address the effectiveness of these practices at Pomaikaʻi Elementary School. In addition, MACC and the DOE's Maui District have been members in the John F.

Kennedy Center for the Performing Arts program, *Partners in Education,* since 1995 and since then have been providing Maui's teachers with high quality professional development in arts integration. The Kennedy Center also supported three years of action research at Pomaikaʻi (2007-10) and consultation on the development of shared leadership at the school.

Since its inception, Pomaikaʻi has cultivated an arts integration model in which: a) all teachers are trained and supported in arts integration throughout the year; b) part time specialists provide discrete arts instruction; c) all students receive integrated arts residencies from partnering teaching artists; and d) a full time arts integration coordinator tunes the map to sustain the vision. Professional development for teachers has been focused on specific arts strategies (such as tableaux, teacher-in-role, and storytelling) as well as big-picture thinking (such as questioning, critical thinking, and literacy – all through the arts). Professional development facilitators engage teachers directly, but also model lessons in the classrooms to demonstrate strategies in action with students, followed by in-school coaching as teachers implement what they have learned. Although the school cannot employ fulltime specialists in each art form due to the financial constraints at the district level, part time specialists teach visual arts, ukulele, and Hawaiian arts. Both national and local teaching artists are the backbone of the school's integration model. Organizations such as the Maui Dance Council provide direct services to classroom students on a regular basis, but also engage in collaboration, co-planning and co-teaching with classroom teachers. Finally, the heart of the model lies in the full time arts integration coordinator who carefully sequences arts learning for both teachers and students, provides ongoing pressure and support to the classroom teachers, maintains a high level of activity in community partnerships, and moves the whole school forward in arts integration through shared leadership.

Theoretical Framework

This study employs a framework of *noncognitive factors,* defined as "ways students interact with the educational context within which they are situated and the effects of these interactions on students' attitudes, motivation and performance" (Farrington et al., 2012, p. 2). Cognitive domains of human experience, measured by IQ and standardized tests, explain what a person knows and can do with content. Hawai'i State Assessment (HSA) results for the 2012-2013 school year reveal Pomaika'i students outperformed those from neighboring elementary schools who will later attend the same middle school. Without controlling for countless variables such as family socio-economic status, level of parent education, or student involvement in extra-curricular activities, it is implausible to draw causal relationship between these academic achievements and involvement in arts integrated curriculum based on test scores alone (Melnick, Witmer, & Strickland, 2011). Winner, Goldstein, and Vincent-Lankrin (2013) suggest even though correlational data reveals how students who participate in a large number of arts courses have higher educational achievement (as measured by scores on verbal and mathematical tests) we cannot conclude that the arts are the *cause* of higher achievement. Accordingly, it is only possible to conclude that the curriculum at Pomaika'i has not placed its pupils at a disadvantage in terms of cognitive performance, as measured by test scores, when compared to its counterparts.

Instead of using the traditional approach to study transfer, Winner et al. (2013) contend researchers should "examine whether learning in one domain predicts greater *preparation for future learning* [emphasis in original] in a transfer domain" (p.33). Noncognitive factors provide an alternative lens for examining and explaining the role of an arts integrated education in preparing students for future learning. Noncognitive factors include a large range of dynamics

embedded in the educational experience: feelings, attitudes, personality traits, beliefs, behaviors, habits, motivations, relationships, engagements, and strategies that contribute to a human's capacity to learn. A recent meta-study published by the University of Chicago (Farrington et al., 2012) details the promise of noncognitive factors, organizes them into overarching categories, and reviews evidence among the literature of each factor. This inquiry adopts three categories within the Chicago report: a) *academic mindset,* or the psychological and socially related attitudes that a student holds with respect to his or her academic goals; b) *learning strategies,* or tactics that support thinking, remembering, or understanding concepts; and c) *social skills* or inter-personal behaviors such as interacting with others in socially acceptable ways through cooperation, assertion and empathy.

In response to Hetland and Winner's (2001) call to "carry out ethnographic studies of exemplary schools that grant the arts a serious role in the curriculum" (p.6), this study pursues an explanation of arts integration as a catalyst for the development of mindsets, strategies and skills for learning in any subject. The arts are neither essential to this recipe, nor do they offer the only path for achieving these things; I have seen teachers in schools across the state wearing T-shirts asking, "Got Grit?" graphic organizers outlining the characteristics of positive mindsets, and school announcement boards extolling the virtues of "Habits of Mind" (Costa & Kallic, 2008). There are many ways to help children love learning and believe they are capable learners. In examining the work at Pomaika'i, however, I submit the integration of the arts is core to the noncognitive dynamics at this particular school. Arts integration has provided teachers with tools for systematically and explicitly connecting children to the kind of energies and attitudes requisite to a positive learning environment.

Method

As an intrinsic case study (Stake, 2010) this research does not strive to meet criteria of reliability or transferability, but does endeavor to rigorously and truthfully explain the significance of one particular approach to arts integration within a broader context of school and life. Schools are complex social and cultural places in which policy can either reproduce or disrupt assumptions (Diem et al., 2014). Ethnographic, qualitative approaches to examining policy recognize the creation of policy as "an extremely complex, often contradictory process" (Levinson, Sutton, & Winstead, 2009, p.770). This qualitative, bounded case study (Yin, 2003) focuses on the way individual graduates of Pomaika'i Elementary School experienced their time there. The case study research strategy employs thick description (Geertz, 1973) and grounded analysis (Strauss & Corbin, 1998) to explain the impact of an education driven by arts integration at the elementary school level within the real-life contexts of young people. The young participants of this study have entrusted me with their stories and impressions to help explain how the Pomaika'i experience has informed their interests, achievements, choices, sensibilities, and skills as they enter middle school.

Participants

Through purposeful sampling (Creswell, 2007) I selected eight key student participants based on the recommendations of a Pomaika'i administrator and a counselor who knew these children well. I invited one group of four students, just graduating from the 5th grade at Pomaika'i Elementary School and poised to enter middle school. The other group of four Pomaika'i graduates had just completed their first year of middle school as 6th graders. The same selection criteria was applicable to both groups of students who had: a) experienced arts integration in Pomaika'i classrooms where teachers implemented strategies and pedagogies with

regularity and fidelity (often and well); b) attended Pomaikaʻi Elementary school for more than three years before transitioning to middle school; and c) strong communication abilities in order to respond to questions with detail and clarity. Each group was represented by a cross-section of boys and girls (see Table 1). Student ethnicity, which does not play a major role in this study, is typical of Maui's population: a blend of Japanese, Filipino, and Caucasian ancestry. Notably, many of the parents' careers and backgrounds do not obviously lend themselves to exposure in the arts. For example, the sample included parents who are accountants, engineers, electricians, police, managers, and health care professionals. Several made statements similar to Glenn's mother who said, "We're not into the arts, not at all."

Table 1

Key Participant Demographics

Student	Grade	Sex
Marco	6	Male
Joshua	6	Male
Brittany	6	Female
Taylor	6	Female
Glenn	5	Male
Charlie	5	Male
Theo	5	Male
Corrine	5	Female

To triangulate student responses, I also interviewed one or more of the key participants' parents, one of each key participants' teachers, and one Pomaikaʻi administrator. Contributions came from a total of ten parents (in two instances a mother and a father both participated) and six teachers (two teachers had more than one student in their classrooms). Independently of the student participants, I interviewed two 5th grade teachers, and four 6th grade teachers. Each of the middle school teachers taught at least one of the student participants in one content area and also served as that student's home room advisor. Several of the teachers I interviewed also have children who attend Pomaikaʻi and several of the parents are also teachers or coaches of the Pomaikaʻi graduates. They volunteered multiple perspectives not limited to a single role.   In accordance with Hawaiʻi's DOE and IRB guidelines, participants provided informed consent or assent, and all names have been replaced with pseudonyms.

My position as a researcher is that of both insider and an outsider for this inquiry (Adler & Adler, 1994). I am an arts educator who has provided professional development for Pomaikaʻi teachers both in and out of school settings, although the students and parents were not familiar with me in this capacity. Being an insider has had its benefits (A. Smyth & Holian, 2008); I am familiar with related literature, theory, and policy of arts education, and well acquainted with the arts-integrated vision, vocabulary, and curriculum at Pomaikaʻi. However, it is possible that responses from some of the participants may have been influenced by what they may have perceived I wanted to hear. It is also possible that my prior knowledge has led through certain assumptions throughout this research process (DeLyser, 2001; Unluer, 2012). It is my best intention to truthfully explain, through evidence, the role of the arts in a young child's education, and neither over state nor advocate beyond the empirical information.

Data

I initiated the study with two focus groups, one for each group of students from the middle school and Pomaikaʻi Elementary School. The focus groups provided an opportunity for student participants to share personal information about themselves in a safe space – their strengths, interests, abilities and priorities. I asked them about their memories of elementary school, their impressions of their arts experiences, and their goals for the future. My primary intention for these focus groups was to establish rapport and begin forming a relationship with the students based on a mutual understanding of the goals for the research project. I also asked some of the same questions about perceived effects of arts integration that I would repeat later in the student interviews so the participants might consider their responses thoughtfully and independently over time.

Following the focus groups, I interviewed each student individually, following a semi-structured protocol designed to elicit specific reflection the role of the arts in their lives. I asked them extending questions based upon the responses they provided in the focus groups and probing questions to elicit more evidence to support their observations. I asked the student participants to delve more deeply into their Pomaika'i experiences, and reflect upon how those experiences played out in their current lives and imagined futures.

I also interviewed parents to hear more about their perspectives on Pomaika'i's culture, vision, curriculum, arts integration pedagogy and the impact of these things on their children. Understanding who the parents are and how they perceived the purpose and value of Pomaika'i's approach to arts integration added detail and dimension to the information the young participants shared and provided a parent's perspective to corroborate student self-perceptions.

Finally, I interviewed each key participants' teacher individually to gather information generally and specifically about the influences of the arts integration methods occurring at Pomaika'i. The middle school teachers were able to reflect on the characteristics of Pomaika'i students attending their school as a whole, as well as the individual strengths and abilities of the children participating in this study. The elementary teachers had the insights of first-hand experiences teaching at Pomaika'i and were able to provide both specific comments about the strengths and challenges of each key participant as well as Pomaika'i students as a whole. Each teacher co-selected three artifacts of student work with the student to use later as a discussion catalyst during his or her interview with me.

Throughout the data collection period, I asked questions of the Pomaika'i administrator with two, short interviews and follow-up emails to describe the model, verify some details provided by other participants, and provide her own perspectives. In addition, I sent each family

a profile with the description of the student along with my analysis of his or her verbatim quotes as a member check.

Analysis

I recorded and transcribed each interaction, and upon completion of the data collection, I used Dedoose software to manually categorize patches of discussion into an initial set of codes. Combining all the information available, I detailed short profiles for each student and conferred with the parents by sending them the write-up to ensure my impressions rang true. Using a grounded theory approach (Strauss & Corbin, 1998) I anchored codes based on emerging patterns and themes, grouped the content of the data in order to help explain it, and conferred again with participants to test the veracity of these explanations. In an iterative process of categorizing and re-categorizing, several important non-cognitive factors became apparent, and I began to use these concepts for selective coding; synthesizing ways arts integration apparently influenced the participants and adapting these codes to reflect words or phrases the participants used.

Non-Cognitive Development Through Arts Integration

The key participants, their families, and their teachers responded with a range of experiences and perspectives to the central question of this study: How does school-wide arts integration in an elementary setting impact student success as they transition to middle school? Explanations were bound to the identity of each child, and the specific social and emotional development of that child. For example, the curriculum challenged Glenn and Charlie, two of the more introverted participants, to develop confidence in their social interactions. Alternatively, the more extroverted students, like Theo or Marco, felt the school built upon their strengths by creating an environment where they could flourish. Despite these individual differences,

common insights and explanations occurred across discussions with participants within three overarching non-cognitive factors that I will discuss in detail: a) academic mindsets; b) learning strategies; and c) social skills.

Academic Mindset

A student who has developed positive attitudes and belief systems about school and about themselves as learners are likely to experience positive learning outcomes as a result of an academic mindset (Farrington et al., 2012; Lipnevich & Roberts, 2011). Beliefs about the importance of fixed character traits, such as talent or intelligence, can be detrimental to student success if these beliefs are not combined with attributes that can be developed through discipline; a focus on growth over time can increase intellectual achievement (Dweck, 2012). Such a dynamic is akin to attribution theory from the field of psychology: if an individual experiences a negative reaction while engaged in a task, such as a failure, and believes this occurred as a result of an innate deficiency, the indivdual will not likely pursue or engage the task again. However, if the individual believes the failure could be attributed to poor effort, motivation, or organization, all factors within his or her control, that individual is more likely to keep trying and ultimately succeed (Dweck, 1975; Weiner, 1979). This study's participants explained ways in which Pomaika'i's art integration supports academic mindsets by contributing to attitudes related to drive, safety, and joy.

Drive. Corrine likes doing homework. Joshua enjoys being graded. Glenn appreciates how his teacher, "pushes and pushes each one of us to reach our goal and to never fall behind our goal." A middle school teacher told me about her Pomaika'i students' reactions to their HSA tests results:

They're so driven, they're very driven, they're always the ones, like, HSA this year, we

said, "Okay, you only take them once and you're done. And you don't have to take it

anymore. That's it. That's all." They were sad, many of them. And some of the

Pomaika'i kids, they wanted their score higher, even though it already exceeds

proficiency.

This "drive, " characterized by tenacity and grit, is a dominant description of Pomaika'i students

who are motivated and focused, with goals to develop beyond proficiency. Pink (2009) defines

drive as that which guides individuals to innovative engagement and excellence through a sense

of autonomy, mastery, and purpose, a concept with powerful applications for both higher

learning and the work place.

Participants attributed processes unique to the arts, such as rehearsal and art criticism, to

the drive apparent in so many of the students' mindsets. Rehearsal is an integral part of the

performing arts, and teachers at Pomaika'i consistently challenged students to develop, reflect

and revise their work in a process akin to rehearsal. Incidentally, this is a natural part of a

formative assessment loop in which teachers and students analyze their own performance and the

performances of others to actively seek out ways to progress and improve. Charlie said he

learned an important lesson during a drama experience:

If you're going to do something, do it, like all you can. Like, don't do it half way. Even if

it makes you feel awkward. Like in drama, I did a lame tree pose, and then my teacher

said, 'Try to be more creative.'

This scenario emphasizes how the arts require a commitment to quality, or else the half-hearted results are imminently observable. Teachers at Pomaikaʻi also engage students in critical thinking protocols around the exemplary artists such as Pablo Picasso or Alvin Ailey, asking students to describe, interpret and evaluate. Marco's mother fondly remembered his 4th grade teacher: "She taught them, you know, what quality work looks like through art."

A necessary element of drive is the mindset of perseverance, or an individual's belief that he or she can succeed, even when a task is uncomfortable or challenging. Corrine explained how she responds to adversity: "If I know that I want to do something or I want to become someone, then I know that I can just keep striving to be that person." She holds Pomaikaʻi teachers responsible for imbuing her with this attitude, "Well, my kindergarten teacher, Ms. Kendra, she would always say, 'Whatever you dream about, just go for it. If there's a problem, try and pass, like go.'"

The contribution of the arts to the development of persistence lies in an ethos of embracing mistakes as opportunities and failures as possibilities. Brittany remembered starting elementary school feeling shy and nervous: "I was kind of scared that I'd probably mess up or something, because when I feel scared, I would hyperventilate sometimes. I'd just be like, 'Oh my god,' and I will freak out because – I don't know…" Through arts lessons, Brittany noticed how all her peers were looking "silly" and imperfectly executing their work in rehearsal, and felt less alone when she "messed up." Teachers did not criticize her mistakes, nor dwell on them, but encouraged her to keep continue her work. She learned how to laugh when her group made mistakes and eventually became quite comfortable with a trial and error approach to learning. Likewise, Charlie found the shared experiences in the arts helped him laugh at himself: "It makes me laugh more, actually. We all laugh at people, and they laugh at us, and we laugh at ourselves.

It's all funny. You don't do that out on the street." Looking "silly" often arose in discussions with the participants of this study, who suggested that opportunities to "look silly" among their peers actually helped them to develop a mindset for taking risks and embracing mistakes. A middle school teacher observed this dynamic in the Pomaikaʻi graduates she teaches: "I would say we found—because I have several teachers that have kids that go to Pomaikaʻi that teach with me—that they are less afraid to make mistakes. They become more risk-takers and more creative."

Safety. Research suggests students who feel they belong within their classroom or school community – accepted, respected, and included – benefit psychologically and academically as they invest more in themselves and in their learning (Gillen-O'Neel & Fuligni, 2013). A sense of belonging is related to socio-cultural factors as well as self-esteem and physiological conditions. Case studies show how a lack of belonging is directly related to school dropout (Ma, 2003). In this study, participants characterized their sense of belonging as "safety."

Pomaikaʻi's approach to the arts is very much an ensemble model, in contrast to a star model common in some arts conservatory or magnet schools. Pomaikaʻi does not place children into competition with each other, compare their skills, or attempt to foster the talents of an elite few. Even when there are main characters in performance projects, teachers cast several actors to trade off the role, rather than putting a solo child in the spotlight. The participants in this study consistently used the word "safe" to describe ways students are embraced and protected by the whole, never isolated or made to feel "awkward." Marco almost metaphorically defines his sense of security: "Usually I don't like singing. But when you have a group behind you, it just gives you more, 'Oh, okay.' My voice is blending, so I don't need to worry."

The collaborative nature of the arts in the classroom helped Taylor feel supported by a community of learners: "Like we got to work a lot with groups. So yeah, it just – they're all my friends, so like it made it really like natural and made me feel comfortable." The school created a space in which students felt calm, connected, and confident. Marco kept telling me he "loved" Pomaika'i Elementary School because it was "awesome," and when I pressed him to explain, he responded, "They're my -- I guess my calabash cousins in a way. It was kind of like my different family, I suppose." In Hawai'i, a "calabash cousin" is someone who shares the bonds and privileges of family but is not actually a blood relative.

Parents of Pomaika'i graduates contrasted their prior experiences with other elementary schools. One parent explained:

Even from the beginning, the tone that was set, I felt more that he was safe there. Just the kind of attitude even the kids take, you know. I guess because of that teamwork thing, like they've got to do this. They've got to learn how to work together from the beginning. It's a lot of the arts integration, like, "Okay, we're doing this. How are we going to?"

A Pomaika'i teacher described the significance of safety in her classroom:

So just being able to be safe and comfortable and feel more accepted by their peers than maybe they would in another school, I think would contribute to their learning greatly, because I think that's the foundation in the classroom… And also, because we do so many things together, it's no longer the child in isolation listening to the teachers. It's so much of group work and pair sharing and speaking to each other and listening to each other. If they didn't feel comfortable taking the risk, all those things wouldn't be possible.

Through ensemble art-making, students self-generate inclusion and support within a community connected by shared goals.

The school also supports school-wide cohesion and belonging beyond the classroom and the grade level boundaries through performance. The study's participants fondly remember May Hoʻike, an annual event when each class performs for the entire school, families, and community to close out the school year. Marco expressed pride when he received accolades from his older peers: "They're like, 'Hey! You're the narrator.' And even the fourth graders, when I was in third grade, they're like, 'Oh, I know you. You're Marco.' They all knew me from narrating. I was like, 'Oh! How did this happen?'" Brittany had a similar experience: "I remember the kindergarteners telling me that while I was dancing in fifth grade for Hoʻike 'I like that one.' I'm just like, 'Oh, wow!'" Younger children look up to their older peers, and older children encourage the younger ones. This recognition between students at varying grade levels encouraged a school-wide sense of belonging.

Joy. In order to do well in school, students must perceive value in tasks and see them as purposeful, relevant, and meaningful. When these things are present, learners experiences intrinsic value and engagement – or in simpler terms, "fun." Intrinsic motivation is fueled when students experience joy with purpose, structure with choice, and energy with control (Egan, 1999; J. Smyth & Fasoli, 2007; Stinson, 1997). When students are deeply involved in activity that is simultaneously challenging and delightful, they experience flow, and the hard work of learning inevitably becomes enjoyable (Bond & Stinson, 2007; Csikszentmihalyi, 1975). Wolk (2008) advocates for the inclusion of the arts within the school day as one method for generating joy for learning.

Reflecting on the value of Pomaikaʻi's arts integrated model, Brittany's mother said: "It's kind of fun, actually. The kids have fun learning. I guess that's what arts integration does. It makes it fun for learning. It's not like when we went to school. My kids love school." Other parents made similar observations, noticing the enthusiasm their children demonstrated for learning at Pomaikaʻi, contrasting that with their own learning experiences, and recognizing ways in which "fun" has contributed to the educational experiences of their children. Theo's mother felt this was especially true for her son:

> I think it gives him a place to shine. Honestly, I think he shines in the arts, and I think that helps him enjoy school. I think it helps him enjoy knowing that he has that ability within himself. He loves to dance, so he shines when he's in dance class. Like I said, it just gives his personality a place to excel.

The students who participated in this study simply felt more engaged when the arts were present in the classroom. For example, Charlie discussed how he felt learning through the arts,

> And, it's more fun…because some kids get super bored. Sometimes, I do that, like almost zone out, because it's usually just drawing, drawing on - and talking and talking. But when you're having fun…Yeah, you get up in your seat and you can laugh, because some kids are twisting so much. And yeah, it's funny.

Having a break from the monotonous routine, the "extraordinary sameness" of school (Goodlad, 1984) supported Charlie's attention; the arts stimulated him into "wide-awakeness" (Greene, 1977) as an active participant in his own learning. Marco suggested that he learned to love reading through his dramatic interpretations of character voices:

I guess sometimes I would put on different accents, I guess kind of just joke around and

be silly when I was younger. I'd put on different voices for the characters. I guess that

kind of influenced me to have fun reading.

For all of these students, learning across content areas was more like playing and came easier as a result. Through the eyes of one teacher, Pomaikaʻi students on the whole "enjoy coming to school, and have enthusiasm for learning." She elaborated:

I think it comes from joy. You know what I mean? I think they're totally more

comfortable with the people they're around and the school that they're in, so they're more

joyous and they're more silly and they're more playful, and it's more who they are.

Such observations endorse Plato's ancient philosophy about the value of play, "for if [students] are not surrounded with such an atmosphere they can never grow up to be well educated and virtuous citizens" (as cited in Courtney, 1968, p.9). Play stimulates a child's cognitive capacities: problem solving, language learning, symbolic thinking, and affective reasoning (Piaget, 1962). Through play a child constructs cultural meanings and basic social norms (Vygotsky, 1962). The value of play clearly extends beyond boundaries of art and into the broader worlds of child development.

However, it is impossible to ignore the centrality of play to the roles and meanings in the art world. For example:

It is no coincidence that the word for the main activity of childhood is the same as the

word for what is done in theatre. Children play games and playwrights write plays. The

artists who recreate the plays for the delight of adults were called players longs before

they were called actors, just as their home was called a playhouse long before it was

called theatre – at least in our language. (Davis, 1981, pg. 1)

Although the arts are shaped by and reflected in the play instinct (Huizinga, 1950) they are not to be confused with play itself. The arts provide the structure through which creativity, discovery and meaning flow, abetted by one or more elements of play. One of the Pomaikaʻi teachers I spoke with had recently transferred from a different school and was initially skeptical about the role of the arts in learning. For a year she dabbled in drama strategies and came to a new conclusion:

> It definitely brought more students into the teaching—involved, engaged, more engaged in learning. So I definitely see the need for incorporating the arts in school, I think it really does bring more engagement with the students.

According to this teacher, the model created by Pomaikaʻi harnesses the power of play through arts processes and structures, creating an environment in which the students sense both purpose and joy in their work.

Learning Strategies

Students can leverage their learning by practicing effective learning strategies, or methods to support remembering, understanding, and problem solving (Farrington et al., 2012). Some learning strategies seem quite obvious in the way they improve student achievement, for example attending class, doing homework, managing time, and seeking help are all clearly healthy habits for learning. In addition to these basic study skills, learning strategies include the development of metacognitive awareness to develop a sense of self-control in learning (Efklides, 2014). Students from Pomaikaʻi formed explanations to support three dominant aspects of learning with respect to metacognition: a) engaging in a variety of strategies including the arts; b) visualizing content through the arts; and c) and "out-of-the-box" problem solving through arts tasks.

Variety. Charlie worked on a coral reef project in the second grade, a 30-second public service announcement incorporating research, watercolor images, narration, and video. When his family came to a community event at the school called "The Artist in Me" and saw what Charlie had created they were "blown away" by the variety of learning that was incorporated in that single project. As his father described it: "That was scientific, that was research, it was art, it was technology." The participants in this study expressed an appreciation for how learning many different things in many different ways enhanced the ways students interacted with content material, views consistent with Multiple Intelligence Theory (Gardner, 1990), Universal Design for Learning (Glass, Meyer, & Rose, 2013; Hall, Meyer, & Rose, 2012) and Differentiated Learning (Tomlinson & McTighe, 2006).

Pomaika'i families communicated a strong appreciation for the way the arts created opportunities for children to learn through different modalities, especially kinesthetically. One parent, who is also a teacher, said, "They do it with the mind, but also with their bodies." Brittany's mother similarly expressed an appreciation for the way the arts meet the diverse learning needs of students: "It doesn't matter what style of learning this child has, but through the arts, they all grasp it." Learning experiences that include the arts extend to more than one dominant type of academically oriented learner with typical proficiencies, and provide options for learning that can both challenge and provide access to a range of learners within a diverse classroom setting.

Charlie shared his appreciation for this approach to learning:

Sometimes they do different strategies. If a couple kids get this strategy, she would teach that, and then, after that, she'll go into an easier, or more complicated strategy so that other kids will learn. There's always at least two strategies to do something…To help the

kids understand better, and – I don't really know. Just to help the kids understand better,

help them learn.

Participants like Charlie could see how their teachers incorporated the arts as tools for learning.

It struck me how several student participants used the word "strategy" when discussing their arts

learning, clearly demonstrating a sense of how the arts are a way of learning, as well as discrete

disciplines of learning. Whether learning *in* the arts, or *through* the arts, students appreciated the

variety, as Corrine explained:

> It feels good, because since there's art, there's different things that's going on in school
>
> instead of the regular subjects like math, reading, and all those. Since there's art, there's
>
> more things to do, and it's more fun because you can go to different classes and learn
>
> different things.

> When Pomaikaʻi was first opening, several parents were initially quite nervous about

enrolling their children there because they feared the arts content and processes would

overshadow, replace or compete with the standard academic education that would help prepare

their children for the future. One parent said, "At first, we couldn't quite put together the art and

the school." Another received advise to enroll his child elsewhere, "I mean, we live in the

district, but we could have moved out." Several other parents were concerned about how learning

through the arts would interact with standards:

> I wasn't quite sure because I wanted to make sure that they got the standards. I wanted to
>
> make sure that they got the basics down and incorporated the arts into it instead of just
>
> being an arts school and not having the solid standards-based learning. It was a concern
>
> to me.

These misgivings faded as parents' paradigms shifted. They began to perceive the presence of

the arts in the curriculum as added value, particularly with respect to the variety of learning

opportunities for their children. Today, parents continue to demand rigor in the classroom, and to

them, the arts integration at Pomaika'i has enhanced not detracted from that rigor. Joshua's

mother, explained:

> It wasn't overly done, I thought. I thought it was good because it really had a strong
>
> foundation of the learning part. They did a lot of researching, reading and talking,
>
> discussions, and then bringing the arts in. I just thought he got a lot out of it. He learned
>
> the most that way.

Visualization. According to dual coding theory, humans generate both mental images

and verbal codes to represent information in their memories for storage, use, and retrieval

(Sadoski & Paivio, 2001, 2007). People think in terms of symbols, such as words and numbers,

as well as through scenes and emotions, and a bridge between visualization and verbal

articulation aids in the formation of meaning. Pomaika'i students were vociferous about how the

arts helped them to visualize what they were learning, and in turn how that helped them form

understanding by creating images in the mind's eye, re-enactment, or modeling.

At Pomaika'i students use their bodies to represent scenarios, concepts or to model

systems through drama and dance. Brittany explained, "When you have to act out, you can see in

your head pretty much." Taylor provided detail with an example to explain her experience

modeling the movements of the solar system through dance:

> In fifth grade, I think it was, we were studying the solar system and how the planets orbit,
> so we had to do a dance about the solar system. So one person was the sun, and then
> we're all spinning around the sun or – yeah, stuff like that, and then it kind of helped me
> understand it better. So it sorta like helps you visualize.

Charlie also commented on his experience learning about the solar system through dance:

> It can help you learn to remember stuff. If you want to remember the world, like its axis is not straight, we did a dance that we tipped sideways and we turned around so we can remember that better. So when you want to remember the earth axis is not straight, it's easier to remember and just drilling that, "Earth axis not straight," like that.

Taylor's comment detailed how she developed understanding and Charlie's comment focused on remembering. Other students mentioned learning about science processes such as the rain cycle and the digestive system in the same manner, using the arts to connect parts to a whole, make the abstract concrete, and develop an impression to help them recall information at a later time.

Dramatic forms of expression added one more dimension to the strategy of visualization; students evoked the feelings of how characters or historical figures may have felt through emotional visualization. Theo explained: "When you're doing drama, you really feel the character. Like if we were doing slavery, we would really feel how a slave felt." Although Theo had difficulty articulating how reproducing these feelings helped him to learn, his mother provided her interpretation:

> So I think that making kids, students internalize how the forefathers did what they did, decide what they have decided, did at that time, or even normal people at that time, it's more meaningful to them, and they understand it.

Generating empathy provided students with concrete emotional imaged with which to connect, better understand the motivations and actions, and see the relevance for themselves in their own lives. Charlie provided an alternative analysis for how generating emotional imagery helped him learn: "In a different way, like you get emotions. It's like muscle memory, almost. When you do that, you remember the things that you were taught." Other students in the study commented on how experiencing reading, math, history, and science through the arts helped them remember content better. Marco said, "it sticks with you" through a more pleasurable process than rote memorization.

Working Outside-of-the-Box. Parent participants in this study expressed concern about what it means to "succeed" in tomorrow's work force, and how that might look very different from the world in which they were raised to compete. Charlie's dad explained: "In order for a society, for us to be successful, it's going to take right-brained thinking, out-of-the-box-approached creation design… I do think that Charlie has more of that than I did." Similarly, Joshua's mother values creativity within the broader context of life and work:

> I think it develops their… it makes them think outside of the box. It makes them see that there are different ways to get to what you need to do. In life, in your job, being creative I think is important—trying to figure things out, find the best way, that type of thing. I think it is important to encourage kids to be creative outside the box…and to think I think people, when they hire others, they're going to look for people who aren't afraid to take risks and try new things. I think that's how you can get ahead. Whether you're selling a car or whatever you're doing, it's important to be creative.

Creativity is a complex concept to define, teach, and measure (Makel, 2009; Reynolds, 2012; Saunders, 2012). Over the course of this study, parents related creativity to the ability to embrace ambiguity, face the unknown, and solve problems in novel ways. To them, arts integration serves each of these facets of creativity.

Parents claimed to see evidence of creativity in the way their children communicate, approach projects at home, and in they ways they interact with their friends. According to Marco's mother, Pomaikaʻi cultivates these behaviors by structuring learning around open-ended prompts in which students "are not told how to do something. There's no right or wrong." Brittany's mother was emphatic about the value of this kind of thinking:

> So I think it impacted her in that way where there are answers in math that are black and white, but there are other answers where there may be one particular answer they're looking for, but then I guess she can be creative in coming up with something else… It's not just this is the right answer and that's it.

Creative problem solving at Pomaikaʻi also comes with an emphasis on student-centered ideas, as opposed to those that might be parroted from an outside source or replicated in a neat

package. One middle school teacher described Pomaikaʻi students in general: "They're creative. They will pick up what to do, and they come up with their own ideas. You don't have to push after that because they will just jump in." Joshua's teacher saw how his creativity had a contagious effect on other students: "They're all jumping in on what he sees. That's why I think it's a positive. For a teacher, I appreciate that because that's thinking outside of the box."

These skills also evolve from the emphasis Pomaika'i places on the collaborative generation of ideas requiring young people to offer their own ideas, accept the ideas of others, listen and respond, and negotiate without interference from the ego. Student participants commented on how this process helped them develop stronger ideas than if they had worked alone. Theo said, "We usually like think with each other, what would be the best choice, or we kind of like mix it up together," and Corrine confessed, "I feel good working with them, because then you would know what they're thinking about the project and maybe of different ideas to add into the project and not just one." Participants recognized how many voices and ideas can combine to develop surprisingly exciting products.

Social Skills

Evidence indicates positive social skills developed at the elementary level increase academic performance as students engage productively in learning activities (Farrington et al., 2012; Lipnevich & Roberts, 2011). Causal effects are difficult to prove because they overlap extensively with other noncognitive factors. Social and emotional well-being, school environment, and teacher practices likely corroborate with social skills to impact positive behaviors (Durlak, Weissberg, Dymnicki, Taylor, & Schellinger, 2011). However, arts research supports the performance experience as a catalyst for collaboration and teamwork; unity develops among children who invest in the success of their performance group (Simpson Steele

& Kelin, 2012; Sullivan, 2003) as they develop a stronger sense of self (Heath & Roach, 1999;

Stinson, 1997).

Interpersonal relationships formed through arts integrated learning were a large part of

conversations with the participants of this study. Taylor suggested, "I'm not sure how to explain

it. It's just now it's easier to work with groups and to ask teachers for help and just be more

outspoken, not shy." Brittany explained, "It taught us how to connect to others." Their peers felt

similarly; learning through the arts helped them become socially confident young adults with the

ability to form lasting friendships. Patterns of this study indicate learning through the arts helps

elementary students develop in three primary areas: a) self confidence; b) connecting with others

in the learning community; and c) communication.

Self Confidence. Parents frequently commented about their child's demonstrations of

confidence. Joshua's mother surmised, "Just the way he just speaks out and not afraid to be

looked at as somebody who's just -- I don't know. He's not afraid. He takes a lot of risks when

he speaks out." Other amazed mothers and fathers echoed this observation of fearless stage

presence they attributed to experience in the performing arts. Taylor's mom characterized her

daughter's education as "a great experience that really opened her up. She's not afraid. She's

outgoing, outspoken, not afraid to perform in front of a group or people." Glenn, one of the more

reserved contributors to this study, revealed this side to himself according to his mother's story:

> I think he's more confident from doing all this drama stuff. I remember a couple of years
> ago where we had a New Year's party at my mom's house, and he put on a dance
> performance. I couldn't believe it. Yeah, with his cousin, in front of all the relatives and
> stuff, I was like "Oh, my God. I can't believe he did that."

Teachers involved in this study described the key participants as leaders who take

initiative or provide ready assistance to peers. For example, Theo often organizes activities and

vocalizes instructions among his peer group; Corrine and Taylor are quick to assist friends with

their academic work; Brittany and Joshua eagerly plan and direct special events after school.

One teacher noticed leadership in the way Pomaikaʻi students eagerly volunteer to demonstrate

or present in front of the class:

> They're not afraid at all to do something in public presentation, any kind of presentation. I'll give an example with Marco. We were going to talk -- so, we're talking about the gravity on the earth and the moon, and we were defining gravity. And he volunteered and he's thrown up in the air. And the second time, he says he wanted to touch the ceiling.

Improvised or rehearsed, daring demonstrations such as these are not uncommon for the

Pomaikaʻi graduates in this study. Another middle school teacher observed, "Yeah, I think

confidence has a lot to do. Whatever the mind sees, most of the time, the kids perceive it that

way so they will perform to that ability, yeah." This remark is consistent with Bandura and

Schunk's (1981) theories of self-efficacy – when students have confidence they will be

successful in school, they are.

Finally, students themselves observed the influence of the arts on self-confidence.

Brittany remarked:

> I would say it influenced me because it helped me come out of my shell a little bit, because like with the drama, we had to interact and stuff. Yeah, I used to be shy, but now I'm not too shy anymore because of the interaction we did a lot in the school.

There are several explanations for how students came to emerge from their "shells." Performing

arts tasks require students to take risks, and each time they experience success, students may

potentially see themselves as more capable, more effective. It is also feasible that when art tasks

at Pomaikaʻi bring students into meaningful collaborations, students develop confidence by

positively engaging with others in their community. Finally, it is possible that the overall

environment, created by multiple factors discussed within this study, cultivates an attitude in

which children are encouraged to be themselves. Taylor explained: "They tell you not to just be

like a plain person. They want you to be like unique and your own self. They wanted you to express what you feel and like to stand up for what you believe."

Connection. Participants in this study shared many stories about various ways the students demonstrated love for their families and responsibility for the well being of their friends. The students in this study described their peers as "honest" and "kind." They described themselves as "happy" and "caring." Their teachers describe them as "fair," "thoughtful" and "accepting of others." These young adults seemed strongly connected to others.

At Pomaika'i, students frequently work on projects and performances in collaborative groups, interacting with a full range of students both similar and dissimilar to themselves. Marco described what this looked like for him:

> I would learn how to cooperate, work with others very well. Because trust me, when the group thing, where you would do whatever the claps, and then you would try and find a group, if there's some kid that you don't really hang out with or maybe you're not friends with, you don't care, you just try and work and get in a group, do whatever, just set your differences aside and just learn to work with them. And I guess you make friends that way, too.

"The claps" refer to a grouping strategy used by much of the Pomaika'i faculty. While the teacher is clapping, students move randomly around the room, demonstrating spatial awareness and physical control. When the teacher calls out a number, the student must quickly find and physically connect with that same number of students. The goal of forming the group is more important than who is in the group, and students need each other to meet the challenge. Now in middle school, Marco continues to figuratively "connect" with a range of students. His teacher observed; "He can get along with introverted or extroverted. He can get along with rascal kind of kids as well as focused kids." Likewise, Brittany's teacher could see this characteristic in her: "Even those people that may not be like her or are not her type of people, she just accepts them for what they are. I haven't seen her treat them any differently. She treats everybody the same

way." These reports suggest Pomaikaʻi students learned to accept and even embrace others regardless of their diverse characteristics in order to accomplish their performance tasks.

Student-teacher relationships are also strong at Pomaikaʻi. The participants in this study perceived their teachers as "friends" because of the way the teachers would engage, share humor, or even participate in arts experiences alongside the children. When teachers taught creatively and through strategies the students perceived as "fun," students felt respected as learners. Of course, students recognized the many ways teachers connected with them that were not necessarily arts oriented; overall the teachers clearly created an inviting, non-judgmental environment through a variety of tactics, the arts being just one of them. Parents noticed this, as Joshua's mother explained:

> I have to say I was very pleased more with—specifically to Pomaikaʻi and the teachers that were there—just their positive, just how positive they were with the kids, I think for both of my kids, even more I think with the arts integration. That encouraging, that loving, all their teachers were that way. I mean, to a different degree—some are stricter than others—but really just super encouraging effects of the arts experiences seems to have created a unique bond.

Similarly, Brittany's mother characterized the bonding as "gelling" and suggested that it is through teacher preparation and training in arts integration that relationships form:

> They really support each other and work together. Their focus is the students and the learning. Every grade level that my children have been in, I noticed they're very cohesive. All the teachers, they're very close, and it shows in what they produce and what they do for the children… I don't know if arts integration has something to do with it, but they do all this training together, it's a new style of teaching. They have one of the best schools here.

Brittany's mother just hints at the idea that when teachers bond through their own arts experiences, the cohesion and relationship they form together spills over into the relationships they form with the students, which in turn spills over into the relationships students are able to form with each other.

Finally, teachers repeatedly described the students of Pomaikaʻi in with respect to their capacity for compassion. One Pomaikaʻi teacher said:

> I think Pomaikaʻi kids are generally kinder to one another. I think there's a culture here of acceptance. Of course things happen, and kids' feelings get hurt. I think that's part of growing up and learning and growing. But in general, I think the kids are much more accepting of one another here and much kinder to one another than I've seen in other schools, in a very significant way.

A middle school teacher made a similar observation, "Even the compassion, I think, for other kids. I see that. With the Pomaikaʻi kids, I don't have a lot of problems with them teasing other kids. They want to help." The Pomaikaʻi arts integrated curriculum requires students to walk in the shoes of others, to develop empathy by imagining the lives of others. It is likely that the process of creating art, the content within the art, the encouragement of teachers who are creative practitioners, and an inclusive environment in which students are regularly expected to engage with each other in creative endeavors all lend support to the development of compassion.

Communication. Part of social navigation includes the skill of communicating across situations and contexts, and Pomaikaʻi offers ample opportunities for students to speak publicly. They receive explicit communication instruction through drama curriculum focused on verbal expression and implicit communication practice while speaking and listening to each other. From the May Hoʻike performances to the Public Relations student committee that conducts tours for visitors to the school, from morning announcements to the oral presentation of class projects – students must speak often and speak well. A Pomaikaʻi teacher who had been a teacher at another school for over a decade noticed:

> I want to say Pomaikaʻi students are able to more verbally express their thoughts and feelings, are more open with those things, I would say, than my [other] elementary students were. And the conversations that I hear when they're doing the arts is more of a rich conversation, more staying on task, I would say, on what needs to be accomplished within that time.

Another Pomaikaʻi teacher constructed a similar contrast with her prior teaching experiences:

> I think the kids here can articulate their thoughts more clearly and are more comfortable with critical thinking in the sense of if I ask them: "What makes you say that?" "Why do you think that?" or "Can you explain?" When I talk to other kids, they do the shoulder shrug. "I don't know." Why does that make you happy? "I don't know, it just does." I feel like they've become more comfortable with that kind of probing here.

The middle school teachers see the same thing when Pomaikaʻi graduates come to them. One explained: "Automatically, even when they communicate, how they speak and they -- whatever they worked on that day and they have to report out, I really like the way they use their voice and just their sharing."

This study's participants felt arts integrated experiences and curriculum benefitted communication. While this may have had some relationship with explicit instruction in oration, such as technical skills for annunciation or projection, the observations the teachers provided lead to the conclusion that student communication is enhanced by the collaborative nature of the arts experiences, the inclusive relationships between members of the community, the value placed the student's self-expression, and on the open-ended exploration of independent thought.

Looking Forward

As the result of Race to the Top competition, Pomaikaʻi and schools across Hawaiʻi have been facing tremendous change at the district, complex and school levels; these are the "seismic shifts" we also face as a nation (Sabol, 2013). Teachers are experiencing challenges implementing the new Common Core State Standards (CCSS) while under the pressure of a new Educator Evaluation System (EES). Data-based decisions rule, accountability is a constant undercurrent, and new Smarter Balance Assessments are rolling out across the state next year. Educators are frequently heard saying "not one more thing."

In this climate, Pomaikaʻi continues to pursue its vision that incorporates arts integration on a foundational level, in all classrooms, at all grade levels. The school is responding to pressures to increase student achievement in STEM subjects by creating professional development for teachers in STE*A*M (STEM + the arts) and employing a STEAM coordinator to ensure quality implementation. They are complying with new requirements to measure Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) by providing teachers with collaboration time and specific strategies for doing so with evidence of learning through the arts. In short, the administration responds to each new demand through a framework of arts integrated teaching and learning.

This model has attracted curious visitors from the local, state, and national educational community, including Hawaiʻi's Department of Education (HDOE) District Superintendent, administrators across Maui, state level curriculum specialists, and the entire Hawaiʻi Board of Education. Visitors include other stakeholders from outside of the educational field, including policy makers from community organizations, politicians, entrepreneurs, local arts organizations, and scientists. According to Pomaikaʻi administration, these visitors regularly comment on the high level of student engagement and their complex problem solving through collaborative work:

> They remark on how the arts challenge students in a variety of ways that are needed in our work force today-to see and think in different perspectives, to communicate with deeper empathy and understanding, to work collaboratively to solve problems. CEOs and managers from businesses and community organizations wonder why other schools aren't integrating the arts when it's clearly effective for developing the kinds of people they want to employ. Business leaders from San Francisco and New York who live on Maui part time have even invested in our arts integrated model, wanting to support our work and hoping other schools will follow. Retired scientists have also invested, saying

Pomaikaʻiʻs innovation and obvious joyful learning of our students is an endeavor they want to get behind."

When English Language Arts curriculum specialists toured Pomaikaʻi school in the spring of 2013, a noticeable shift began. In the short time since then, the HDOE sponsored three professional developments in arts integration, hosting over 80 educators at each event, engaging local and national presenters from the Kennedy Center to specifically address the evolving needs of classroom teachers across the state. The HDOE and its partners have also initiated formal conversations between community arts organizations, leaders in the arts, and leaders in education to explore more ways to connect, share resources, and create a vision for advancing arts education together. Finally, the HDOE has initiated partnerships with three schools to help begin partnerships with community arts organizations (much like Pomaikaʻi shares with the MACC) in order to support a whole-school arts integration model. These latter two initiatives represent a major paradigm shift as the HDOE begins to see community arts organizations as partners in education.

Policies at school, state, and district levels are traditionally informed by positivist frameworks with linear models defined by measurable facts (Diem, Young, Welton, Mansfield, & Lee, 2014). In addition to research evidence, external drivers for policy might include urgency, ideology, international benchmarking, cost, and attitudes of electoral bodies (Perry, Amadeo, Fletcher, & Walker, 2010). However, community stakeholders are an especially strong force in shaping arts education policy (Miksza, 2013). This discussion highlights several of the strong voices of support that come from Pomaikai's families, teachers, students and community members. Personal experiences are also a factor in policy decision-making; Senechal (2013)

argues for sustained development of personal responsibility (in contrast to the more uniform, unilateral measures of accountability) in the shaping of policy:

> Responsibility is internal self-guidance, a combination of thought and action based on our sense of what is right, fair, good, appropriate, or beautiful. It involves the full mind and conscious as well as external manifestations of responsibility, and only part of it. That is, accountability (in its current usage) refers to the fulfillment of those activities than an outsider can enumerate and assess. (p. 48)

This implies decisions might be made from the wisdom of experience in balance with data. By opening its doors to teachers, principals, and administrators throughout the district, Pomaikaʻi has provided a lived experience to inform visitors. As a result, shifts in rhetoric, curriculum, professional development opportunities, and individual school priorities are beginning to surface.

These are important action steps for the advancement of arts education within school reform, and though they might seem subtle, fall perfectly into line with the long-term goals of Hawaiʻi's education system. With the launch of Race to the Top in Hawaiʻi has come a commitment to improve student readiness for college, career and community. Studies focusing on college student achievement conclude noncognitive factors contribute to college success rates, and that college admissions procedures might do well to attend to such factors (Delaney, Harmon, & Ryan, 2013; Noonan, Sedlacek, & Veerasamy, 2005; Schmitt, 2012). Grade point averages in middle school, often incorporating the effects of noncognitive factors, are early indicators of performance in high school, and academic behaviors are a better indicator for success or failure in the 9th grade than achievement test scores alone (Neild, 2009; Neild, Stoner-Eby, & Furstenberg, 2008). In short, noncognitive factors play a powerful role in preparing

children for later success in higher education, jobs, and in society. A model involving whole school arts integration may very well set that success into motion.

While this discussion about dynamics of academic mindsets, learning strategies, and social skills is limited to the experiences of a small number of students and families from one Hawai'i elementary school, it could inform other educational settings with similar goals based on teaching and learning through the arts. This study is limited to the exploration of the phenomena of arts integrated learning for a general education population; further research into the experiences of students with disabilities is warranted. It is my hope to return to the eight families who participated in this study in three years as they transition into high school, and again in another four years as they transition out of high school. Do the noncognitive strengths sparked in the formative years have lasting power? What happens to students as they move into new learning environments that do not emphasize integrated arts learning? More longitudinal research may help us understand how early experiences with the arts influence the way a child might interact with the world later in life. Such information would inform policy makers as they make decisions about what should be taught in schools, how it should be taught, and what resources would best support students as they take on the challenges of higher education, employment, and citizenship within their communities.

References

Adler, P.A., & Adler, P. (1994). Observational techniques. In N. K. Denzin & Y. S. Lincoln (Eds.), *Handbook of qualitative research* (pp. 377-392). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Bandura, A., & Schunk, D.H. (1981). Cultivating competence, self-efficacy, and intrinsic interest through proximal self-motivation. *Journal of Personalist and Social Psychology, 41*, 586-598.

Bond, Karen E., & Stinson, Susan W. (2007). 'It's work, work, work, work': Young people's experiences of effort and engagement in dance. *Research in Dance Education, 8*(2), 155-183.

Bresler, Liora. (1995). The subservient, co-equal, affective, and social integration styles and their implications for the arts. *Arts Education Policy Review, 96*(5), 31-36.

Caldwell, Brian, & Vaughan, Tanya. (2012). *Transforming education through the arts*. Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.

Catterall, James. (2009). *Doin well and doing good by doing art: The effects of education in the visual arts and performing arts on the achievements and values of young adults*. Los Angeles: Imagination Group.

Catterall, James S., Dumais, Susan A., & Hampden-Thompson, Gillian. (2012). The arts and achievement in at-risk youth: Findings from four longitudinal studies. Washington, D.C.: National Endowment for the Arts.

Cornett, Claudia. (1999). *The arts as meaning makers: Integrating literature and the arts throughout the curriculum*. New Jersey: Merill-Prentice Hall, Inc.

Costa, Arthur L., & Kallic, Bena (Eds.). (2008). *Learning and leading with habits of mind: 16 essential characteristics for success*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Courtney, R. (1968). *Play, drama and thought*. London: Castle & Company, LTD.

Creswell, J.W. (2007). *Qualitative inquiry and research design: Choosing among five approaches*. Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Csikszentmihalyi, Mihaly. (1975). *Beyond boredom and anxiety: Experiencing flow in work and play*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Delaney, Liam, Harmon, Colm, & Ryan, Martin. (2013). The role of noncognitive traits in undergraduate study behaviors. *Economics of Education Review, 32*, 181-195.

DeLyser, D. (2001). "Do you really live here?" Thoughts on insider research. *Geographical Review, 91*(1), 441-453.

Dewey, John. (1934). *Art as experience*. New York: Perigree Books.

Diem, Sarah, Young, Michelle D., Welton, Anjale D., Mansfield, Katherine Cumings, & Lee, Pei-Ling. (2014). The intellectual landscape of critical policy analysis. *International Journal of Qualitative Studies in Education, 27*(9), 1068-1090.

Durlak, J.A., Weissberg, R.P., Dymnicki, A.B., Taylor, R.D., & Schellinger, K.B. (2011). The impact of enhancing students' social and emotional learning: A meta-analysis of school-based universal interventions. *Child Development, 82*(1), 405-425.

Dweck, Carol S. (1975). The role of expectations and attributions in the alleviation of learnerd helplessness. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 31*(4), 674-685.

Dweck, Carol S. (2012). Mindsets and human nature: Promoting change in the Middle East, the Schoolyard, the Racial Divide, and Willpower. *American Psychologist, 67*(8), 614-622.

Efklides, Anastasia. (2014). How does metacognition contribute to the regulation of learning? An integrative approach. *Psychological Topics, 23*(1), 1-30.

Egan, Keiran. (1999). *Children's minds, talking rabbits and clockwork oranges; Essays on education*. New York: Teacher's College Press.

Eisner, Elliot W. (1972). *Educating artistic vision*. New York: Macmillan Co.

Eisner, Elliot W. (2002). *The arts and the creation of mind*. New Haven: Yale University Press.

Farrington, C.A., Roderick, M., Allensworth, E., Nagaoka, J., Keyes, T.S., Johnson, D.W., & Beechum, N.O. (2012). Teaching adolescents to become learners. The role of

noncognitive factors in shaping school performance: A critical literature review. Chicago: University of Chicago Consortium on Chicago School Research.

Fisher, Douglas, & McDonald, Nan. (2004). Stormy weather: leading purposeful curriculum integration with and through the arts. *Teaching Artist Journal, 2*(4), 240-248.

Gardner, Howard. (1990). *Art education and human development*. Los Angeles: Getty Publications.

Geertz, Clifford. (1973). *The interpretation of cultures: Selected essays*. New York: Basic Books.

Gillen-O'Neel, Cari, & Fuligni, Andrew. (2013). A longitudinal study of school belonging and academic motivation across high school. *Child Development, 84*(2), 678-692.

Glass, Don, Meyer, Anne, & Rose, David. (2013). Universal design for learning and the arts. *Harvard Education Review, 83*(1), 98-119.

Goodlad, John. (1984). *A place called school*. New York, NY: McGraw-Hill.

Greene, Maxine. (1977). Toward wide-awakeness: An argument for the arts and humanities in education. *Teachers College Record, 79*(1), 119-125.

Greene, Maxine. (1995). *Releasing the imagination: Essays on education, the arts, and social change*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Gullatt, David. (2008). Enhancing student learning through arts integration: Implications for the profession. *High School Journal, 91*(4), 12-25.

Hall, Tracey E., Meyer, Anne, & Rose, David H. (Eds.). (2012). *Universal design for learning in the classroom: Practical applications*. New York: Guilford Press.

Heath, S., & Roach, A. (1999). Imaginitive actuality: Learning in the arts during nonschool hours. In E. Fisk (Ed.), *Champions of change: The impact of the arts on learning* (pp. 19-

34). Washington, DC: Arts Education Partnership and President's Committee on the Arts and Humanities.

Hetland, Lois, & Winner, Ellen. (2001). The arts and academic achievement: What the evidence shows. *Arts Education Policy Review, 102*(3-6).

Huizinga, Johan. (1950). *Homo ludens*. Boston: The Beacon Press.

Krug, D., & Cohen-Evon, N. (2000). Curriculum integration positions and practices in arts education. *Studies in Art Education, 41*(3), 258-275.

Levinson, B.A., Sutton, M., & Winstead, T. (2009). Education policy as a practice of power: Theoretical tools, ethnographic methods, democratic options. *Education Policy, 23*, 767-795.

Lipnevich, Anastasia A., & Roberts, Richard D. (2011). Noncognitive skills in education: Emerging research and applications in a variety of international contexts. *Learning and Individual Differences, 22*, 173-177.

Ma, Xin. (2003). Sense of belonging to school: Can schools make a difference? *The Journal of Educational Reserach, 96*(6).

Makel, Mathew C. (2009). Help us creativity researchers, you're our only hope. *Psychology of Aesthetics, Creativity, and the Arts, 3*(1), 38-42.

Mason, Christine Y., Steedly, Kathlyn M., & Thormann, Mary S. (2008). Impact of arts integration on voice, choice, and access. *Teacher Education and Special Education, 31*(1), 36-46.

McDonald, N., & Fisher, D. (2000). *Developing arts-loving readers: Top ten questions teachers are asking about integrated arts education*. Baltimore: Scarecrow Press.

Melnick, Steven A., Witmer, Judith T. , & Strickland, Martha J. (2011). Cognition and student learning through the arts. *Arts Education Policy Review, 112*(3), 154-162.

Miksza, Peter. (2013). Arts education advocacy: The relative effects on school-level influences on resources for arts education. *Arts Education Policy Review, 114*, 25-32.

Mishook, Jacob J. , & Kornhaber, Mindy L. (2006). Arts integration in an era of accountability. *Arts Education Policy Review, 107*(4), 3-11.

Murray, Beth. (2004). Revisioning visions: Narrative case studies of classroom teachers' changing views on drama. *Youth Theatre Journal, 15*, 95-104.

Neild, R.C. (2009). Falling off track during the transition to high school: What we know and what can be done. *The Future of Children, 19*(53-76).

Neild, R.C., Stoner-Eby, S., & Furstenberg, F. (2008). Connecting entrance and departure: The transition to 9th grade and high school dropout. *Education and Urban Society, 40*(5), 543-569.

Noonan, Brigid, Sedlacek, William, & Veerasamy, Suthakaran. (2005). Employing noncognitive variables in admitting and advising community college students. *Community College Journal of Research and Practice, 29*(6), 463-469.

Perry, Adrian, Amadeo, Christian, Fletcher, Mike, & Walker, Elizabeth. (2010). Instinct or reason: How education policy is made and how we might make it better. New Zealand: CfBT Education trust.

Piaget, J. P. (1962). *Play, dreams, and imitation in childhood*. New York: Norton.

Pink, Daniel. (2009). *Drive: The surprising truth about what motivates us*. New York: Riverhead Books.

Purnell, Paula. (2004). A place for the arts: The past, the present and teacher perceptions. *Teaching Artist Journal, 2*(3), 153-161.

Rabkin, Nick, & Redmond, Robin. (2006). The arts make a difference. *Educational Leadership, 63*(5), 60-64.

Remer, Jane. (1990). *Changing schools through the arts.* New York: American Council for the Arts.

Reynolds, Luke. (2012). *A call to creativity: Writing, reading, and inspiring students in an age of standardization*. New York: Teachers College.

Sabol, Robert F. (2013). Seismic shifts in education landscap: What do they mean for arts education and arts education policy? *Arts Education Policy Review, 114*(1), 33-45.

Sadoski, Mark, & Paivio, Allan. (2001). *Imagery and text: A dual coding theory of reading and writing*. Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates, Inc. .

Sadoski, Mark, & Paivio, Allan. (2007). Toward a Unified Theory of Reading. *Scientific Studies of Reading, 11*(4), 337-356. doi: 10.1080/10888430701530714

Saunders, Lesley. (2012). Silences and silence in 'creativity'. *London Review of Education, 10*(2), 215-225.

Schmitt, Neal. (2012). Development of rationale and measures of noncognitive college student potential. *Educational Psychologist, 47*(1), 18-29.

Senechal, Diana. (2013). Measure against measure: Responsibility versus accountability in education. *Arts Education Policy Review, 114*, 47-53.

Simpson Steele, Jamie, & Kelin, Dan. (2012). Dramatic differences: The powerof playbuilding for young English language learners. *The Tapestry Journal, 4*(2), 19-31.

Skilling, W., & Carstensen, J. (2003). Arts awakenings. *American School Board Journal, 190*(10), 32-34.

Smyth, A., & Holian, R. (2008). Credibility issues in reserach from within organisations. In P. Sikes & A. Potts (Eds.), *Researching education from the inside*. New York, NY: Taylor & Francis.

Smyth, John, & Fasoli, Lyn. (2007). Climbing over the rocks in the road to student engagement and learning in a challenging high school in Australia. *Educational Research, 49*(3), 273-295.

Stake, Robert E. (2010). *Qualitative research: Studying how things work*. New York: Guilford Publications, Inc.

Stinson, Susan W. (1997). A question of fun: Adolescent engagement in dance education. *Dance Research Journal, 29*(2), 49-688.

Stokes, Kelly J. (2004). The arts integrated curriculum: Friend or foe? *Youth Theatre Journal, 18*, 55-67.

Strauss, Anselm, & Corbin, Juliet. (1998). *Basics of qualitative research* (Second ed.). Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications.

Sullivan, Paul Anthony. (2003). Effects of a theatre arts process on selected attributes of middle school-age psychosocial development and self-esteem.   Retrieved November 13, 2007, from ProQuest Digital Dissertations database.

Tomlinson, Carol Ann, & McTighe, Jay. (2006). *Integrating differentiated instruction + understanding by design*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development.

Unluer, Sema. (2012). Being an insider research while conducting case study research. *The Qualitative Report, 17*(58), 1-14.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1962). *Thought and language*. Cambridge: The MIT Press.

Warner, Christine D., & Andersen, Christopher. (2004). "Snails are science": Creating context for science inquiry and writing through process drama. *Youth Theatre Journal, 18*, 68-86.

Weiner, B. (1979). A theory of motivation for some classroom experiences. *Journal of Educational Psychology, 71*(1), 3-25.

What is arts integration: Explore the Kennedy Center's comprehensive definition. (2012). Retrieved November 21, 2012, 2012, from http://artsedge.kennedy-center.org/educators/how-to/arts-integration-beta/what-is-arts-integration-beta.aspx

Winner, Ellen, Goldstein, Thalia R., & Vincent-Lancrin, Stephan. (2013). *Art for art's sake? The impact of arts education* doi:10.1787/9789264180789-en

Wolk, Steven. (2008). Joy in School. *Educational Leadership, 66*(1), 8-15.

Yin, Robert K. (2003). *Case study research: Design and methods* (Vol. 5). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.